Clim. Past Discuss., 6, 1453–1471, 2010 www.clim-past-discuss.net/6/1453/2010/ doi:10.5194/cpd-6-1453-2010 © Author(s) 2010. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal Climate of the Past (CP). Please refer to the corresponding final paper in CP if available.

# Rapid changes in ice core gas records – Part 1: On the accuracy of methane synchronisation of ice cores

## P. Köhler

Alfred Wegener Institute for Polar and Marine Research, P.O. Box 120161, 27515 Bremerhaven, Germany

Received: 24 June 2010 - Accepted: 6 August 2010 - Published: 11 August 2010

Correspondence to: P. Köhler (peter.koehler@awi.de)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.



## Abstract

Methane synchronisation is a concept to align ice core records during rapid climate changes of the Dansgaard/Oeschger (D/O) events onto a common age scale. However, atmospheric gases are recorded in ice cores with a log-normal-shaped age distri-

- <sup>5</sup> bution probability density function, whose exact shape depends mainly on the accumulation rate on the drilling site. This age distribution effectively shifts the mid-transition points of rapid changes in CH<sub>4</sub> measured in situ in ice by about 58% of the width of the age distribution with respect to the atmospheric signal. A minimum dating uncertainty, or artefact, in the CH<sub>4</sub> synchronisation is therefore embedded in the concept
   <sup>10</sup> itself, which was not accounted for in previous error estimates. This synchronisation artefact between Greenland and Antarctic ice cores is for GRIP and Byrd less than 40 years, well within the dating uncertainty of CH<sub>4</sub>, and therefore does not calls the overall concept of the bipolar seesaw into question. However, if the EPICA Dome C ice core is aligned via CH<sub>4</sub> to NGRIP this synchronisation artefact is in the most recent unified ice
- <sup>15</sup> core age scale (Lemieux-Dudon et al., 2010) for LGM climate conditions of the order of three centuries and might need consideration in future gas chronologies.

## 1 Introduction

One important approach to align climate records derived from different ice cores along a common time scale is the synchronisation of prominent and rapid changes in methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) (Blunier et al., 1998, 2007; Blunier and Brook, 2001). During the last glacial period the rapid stadial/interstadial changes of Dansgaard/Oeschger (D/O) events recorded in Greenland ice cores (Johnsen et al., 1992) were connected with fast (decades to centuries) and large changes in the CH<sub>4</sub> concentration (Chappellaz et al., 1993), which is measured in situ in the gases entrapped in the ice. These rapid tem-

<sup>25</sup> perature changes during D/O events in the north are within the concept of the bipolar seesaw (Stocker and Johnsen, 2003) connected with similar rapid changes of opposite sign in the South Atlantic (Barker et al., 2009). All D/O events of marine isotope stage



(MIS) 3 have been identified to be connected with more gradual Antarctic warm events, called Antarctic Isotope Maxima (AIM), in Antarctic ice cores. The gradual temperature rise in the Antarctic ice cores during a stadial cold phase in the north was exactly switching to a gradual cooling in the south at the onset of rapid warming in Greenland

5 (EPICA-community-members, 2006). The more gradual changes in Antarctic temperature proxies were attributed to the large heat reservoir of the Southern Ocean (Stocker and Johnsen, 2003). The D/O events during MIS 5 are connected to AIM in a more complicated pattern than suggested by the bipolar seesaw (Capron et al., 2010).

Recently, a consistent synchronisation of various ice cores (NGRIP, EPICA Dome

- <sup>10</sup> C (EDC), EPICA DML (EDML), Vostok) was proposed (Lemieux-Dudon et al., 2010) which combined the use of various different age markers from the ice matrix (e.g. volcanic horizons, magnetic reversals, <sup>10</sup>Be peaks) and the gas phase to overcome short-comings of previous age scales (Ruth et al., 2007; Loulergue et al., 2007; Parrenin et al., 2007). Here, especially the synchronous matching of rapid changes in CH<sub>4</sub> was
- <sup>15</sup> a prominent target to align ice core climate records over the last glacial cycle, especially over Termination I (Fig. 1). In addition to the age markers to synchronise ice cores, models are used to calculate the thinning of ice sheets (Huybrechts et al., 2007) and the firn densification during gas enclosure (Schwander et al., 1993; Goujon et al., 2003). Furthermore, in the case of Greenland ice cores annual layers are counted over the last 60 har (Syapscon et al., 2008).

<sup>20</sup> the last 60 kyr (Svensson et al., 2008).

Ice cores gas records are significantly younger than the ice matrix, this age difference is called  $\Delta$ age. To synchronise ice cores via CH<sub>4</sub> one has to perform various subsequent steps. (1) Develop a chronology for the ice matrix of one ice core which agrees best with absolute age (here: annual layer counted ice core age scale of Green-

<sup>25</sup> land ice cores GICC05 (Svensson et al., 2008)). (2) Calculate a gas age chronology (or  $\Delta$ age) based on rapid changes in both the isotopic temperature measured in the ice matrix and CH<sub>4</sub> during D/O events. (3) Synchronise the gas chronology of other ice cores via CH<sub>4</sub> to this first ice core. (4) Refine (or calculate) the ice chronology for the other cores.



However, gases entrapped in ice and measured in situ in ice cores have a typical age distribution probability density function (PDF) which they derive during mixing in the firn before bubble close-off. This age distribution PDF mainly depends on local accumulation rate (and temperature), and can be calculated with firn densification models

- <sup>5</sup> (Fig. 2). These PDF are very similar for  $CO_2$  and  $CH_4$  (Spahni et al., 2003). The age distribution PDF effectively leads to gas records in the ice cores that differ during rapid changes from the true atmospheric signal. The in situ measured  $CH_4$  signal is attenuated in comparison to the true atmospheric one. The back calculation from the in situ ice core measurements to the atmospheric signal is not unique. This leads to chronol-
- <sup>10</sup> ogy artefacts in two of the four mentioned steps necessary for ice core synchronisation mentioned above (Fig. 3): (i) The alignment of rapid changes in the isotopic temperature proxy and in situ measured  $CH_4$  to constrain  $\Delta$ age (step 2), or to connect the ice and gas chronologies of individual cores is biased. (ii) The synchronisation of ice cores along rapid changes in  $CH_4$  measured in situ (step 3) has an embedded dating artefact
- <sup>15</sup> which depends on the gas age distribution PDF. Both potential sources of dating errors were not mentioned explicitly in descriptions of gas chronologies and synchronisation attempts (Blunier et al., 2007; Loulergue et al., 2007; Lemieux-Dudon et al., 2010). We will focus here on the synchronisation effect (artefact ii). In detail, we will estimate the size of this synchronisation artefact for the two EPICA ice cores and NGRIP as con-
- <sup>20</sup> tained in the most recent age scale (Lemieux-Dudon et al., 2010). Finally, we discuss its consequences and that of the age distribution for  $\Delta$ age (artefact i) for our current understanding of the bipolar seesaw. In a companion paper (Rapid changes in ice core gas records – Part 2) the effect of the age distribution PDF on the rapid rise in CO<sub>2</sub> at the onset of the Bølling/Allerød is discussed (Köhler et al., 2010b). There, the final
- interpretation which needs to set the CO<sub>2</sub> rise into the correct temporal context to other climate events was only possible after the correction of the age model which followed the understanding of the CH<sub>4</sub> synchronisation artefact.



#### 2 Methods

The age distributions PDF of gases entrapped in ice cores calculated with firn densification models (Joos and Spahni, 2008) can be approximated (Köhler et al., 2010a) by the following log-normal function (Fig. 2).

5 
$$y = \frac{1}{x \cdot \sigma \cdot \sqrt{2\pi}} \cdot e^{-0.5 \left(\frac{\ln(x) - \mu}{\sigma}\right)^2}$$

with *x* (yr) as the time elapsed since the last exchange with the atmosphere. We chose for simplicity  $\sigma = 1$ , which leads to an *expected value (mean) E* of the PDF of  $E = e^{\mu - 0.5}$ . Equation (1) is thus fully described once *E* is known and yields for the LGM and current conditions for EDC (Fig. 2) a reasonable agreement ( $r^2 \approx 0.9$ ) with the results of a firn densification model (Joos and Spahni, 2008). The age distribution PDF for CH<sub>4</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> are very similar and differ only in detail (Fig. 2). The *expected value E* is in the terminology of gas physics described as *width* of the PDF, a terminology which we will also use in the following. *E* is different, and should not be confused with the *most likely* 

value defined by the location of the maximum of the PDF.
 Although, these age distribution PDF are calculated with firn densification models for all ice cores, for which a gas chronology needs to be applied, they are seldomly shown in details in publications (e.g. Spahni et al., 2003; Joos and Spahni, 2008). The usage of Eq. (1) as a substitute for the age distribution PDF therefore allows us without the usage of a firn densification model to mimic the effect of the gas enclosure

<sup>20</sup> process on an ice core gas record. Furthermore, besides published values for the width of the age distribution PDF for EDC and GRIP we estimate E based on the inverse relationship between E and the accumulation rate (Table 1). This is certainly a simplification, but should still be a reasonable approach to show the order of magnitude of the synchronisation artefact.

25

10

The age distribution PDF acts like a filter function on peaks in the true atmospheric  $CH_4$ . Its application shifts the onset of a  $CH_4$  peak by *E* years towards older ages (Fig. 4a). This age offset is corrected during the preparation of gas chronologies of ice cores



(1)

with the effect, that the onset in a rapid change in  $CH_4$  in the true atmospheric signal and that measured in situ in ice cores occur simultaneously (Fig. 4b).

## 3 Results

During wiggle matching of different paleo records the mid-transition point of rapid changes is often taken as reference tie-point, on which the respective transition is 5 aligned to. The approach of mid-transition points is taken here for the sake of argument, but we are aware, that more sophisticated models might be used, which would nevertheless still have to cope with the synchronisation artefact discussed here. In the case of  $CH_4$  synchronisation from ice cores the in situ measured mid-transition points differ from the true atmospheric  $CH_4$  by about 58% of the mean gas age of the rele-10 vant ice core in the respective climate period of interest (Fig. 5). The alignments of various ice cores performed so far synchronised the in situ measured  $CH_4$  data. A more precise approach would try to use the underlying true atmospheric  $CH_4$  for synchronisation. Unfortunately, the true atmospheric signal is not precisely known and can only be approximated using assumptions on the rates of change and amplitudes which might have been occurred in the atmosphere. However, if  $CH_4$  synchronisations rely on the ice core CH₄ data they then have a dating artefact which depends on the

embedded age offset between true atmospheric values and in situ measurements. We show for the cases of EDC, EDML and NGRIP typical mean gases ages as

calculated from firn densification models or as approximated from recent accumulation rates for pre-industrial and LGM climates (Table 1). This should illustrate the orders of magnitude. The width *E* of the age distribution PDF in NGRIP is always below 100 yr, while it rises to 600 yr in EDC for LGM climate, with EDML values in-between.

We now apply how an artificial  $CH_4$  peak with a true atmospheric amplitude of 400 ppbv, which changes in 50 years, would be recorded in different ice cores. If the age correction by the width *E* of the age distribution PDF is applied, the onset in  $CH_4$  in the atmosphere and in all ice cores is dated to be simultaneously, but the mid-transition points in the ice cores are recorded 356, 143 and 55 (120, 50 and 25) years later than



in the atmosphere under LGM (pre-industrial) conditions for EDC, EDML and NGRIP, respectively (Fig. 4b, c). A wiggle matching alignment of ice core  $CH_4$  is therefore at maximum as accurate as the difference of the dating of these mid-transition points from the true atmospheric signal:

 $_{\circ}$  1. For EDC and NGRIP at LGM: 356–55 = 301 years.

2. For EDC and EDML at LGM: 356-143 = 213 years.

3. For EDML and NGRIP at LGM: 143–55 = 88 years.

The embedded synchronisation error between EDML and NGRIP falls within the given uncertainty of 100 to 160 years assumed so far (Lemieux-Dudon et al., 2010).
The synchronisation artefact between EDC and both other ice cores of 200 to 300 years for LGM conditions is however to my knowledge larger than uncertainties given so far, e.g. the uncertainty in the CH<sub>4</sub> synchronisation between EDC and EDML is in general (with a few exceptions) smaller than 200 years (Loulergue et al., 2007). Furthermore, Loulergue et al. (2007) and Lemieux-Dudon et al. (2010) do not mention the effect of the gas age distribution PDF on the accuracy of the synchronisation as discussed here. It is presumably not included in their estimated uncertainties.

#### 4 Discussions and conclusions

The Byrd and GRIP ice cores are those on which the asynchrony of fast climate change of Antarctic and Greenland was first discovered (Blunier et al., 1998). If our understand <sup>20</sup> ing of the effect of the age distribution PDF on the dating accuracy as proposed here is applied to these ice cores a CH<sub>4</sub> synchronisation artefact of less than 40 years during LGM climate conditions is achieved (Table 1). Furthermore, for the one-to-one coupling of all Greenland D/O events to Antarctic Isotopic Maxima a synchronisation error of 400–800 yr in MIS 3 was given (EPICA-community-members, 2006). Both conclu <sup>25</sup> sions imply that our current understanding of the biopolar seesaw does not need to



be revised. However, the acknowledgment of the  $CH_4$  sychronisation artefact as discussed here enables us to either correct for it, or to state a more realistic, e.g. larger uncertainty connected to it.

- The consequence of this dating artefact embedded in CH<sub>4</sub> synchronisation is especially important for the interpretation of other gas records (e.g. CO<sub>2</sub> or N<sub>2</sub>O), while for the synchronisation of records from the ice matrix the still large uncertainty of several centuries in Δage has also to be taken into account (e.g. Blunier et al., 2007). The still existing most precise and temporally highest resolved record of CO<sub>2</sub> over Termination I was measured on the EDC ice core (Monnin et al., 2001; Lourantou et al., 2010) (Fig.
- <sup>10</sup> 1a). Because CH<sub>4</sub> measured on the same ice core was used for synchronisation it seemed so far possible to set rapid changes in CO<sub>2</sub> precisely in temporal relation to changes in northern hemispheric temperature (e.g. NGRIP  $\delta^{18}$ O). However, this assumption is now weakened by the additional synchronisation error between EDC and NGRIP of ~200 years at the onset of the Bølling/Allerød. Furthermore, the whole con-
- <sup>15</sup> cept of gas age distribution has also to be applied for  $CO_2$  to account for the effect, that the in situ  $CO_2$  data of EDC are not the true atmospheric signal, but only its attenuation after the application of the age distribution PDF to account for the gas enclosure process in the firn column (Köhler et al., 2010b).

What are now the consequences of the embedded dating error for Termination I, for which the newest age model of Lemieux-Dudon et al. (2010) provided a very accurate synchronisation of ice core CH<sub>4</sub> (Fig. 1b)? A firn densification model with heat diffusion (Goujon et al., 2003) calculates for the onset of the Bølling/Allerød warming a width *E* of the age distribution PDF in EDC, which lies with 400 years in-between those of the LGM and the pre-industrial climate (Köhler et al., 2010b). If similar in-between values

of *E* are assumed for the other ice cores we then calculate for an artificial  $CH_4$  peak as substitute for the Bølling/Allerød warm interval an error in the  $CH_4$  synchronisation of 244, 110 and 50 between the true atmosphere and EDC, EDML and NGRIP, respectively (Fig. 4d).



In summary, we provided details how the age distribution of atmospheric gases entrapped in ice cores is responsible for a difference of the in situ measured values from the true atmospheric signal. The gas age distribution therefore blurs the accuracy of CH<sub>4</sub> synchronisation of fast D/O events. This embedded synchronisation error was so far unaccounted for and introduces a dating artefact of up to several centuries between individual ice cores and between ice cores and the true atmospheric signal. Mid-transition points are shifted by about 58% of the width *E* of the age distribution PDF towards younger ages.

*Acknowledgements.* Renato Spahni kindly provided electronic output from the firn densification model published in Joos and Spahni (2008).

#### References

Andersen, K. K., Ditlevsen, P. D., Rasmussen, S. O., Clausen, H. B., Vinther, B. M., Johnsen, S. J., and Steffensen, J. P.: Retrieving a common accumulation record from Greenland ice cores for the past 1800 years, J. Geophys. Res., 111, D15106, doi:10.1029/2005JD006765, 2006. 1465

15

Barker, S., Diz, P., Vantravers, M. J., Pike, J., Knorr, G., Hall, I. R., and Broecker, W. S.: Interhemispheric Atlantic seesaw response during the last deglaciation, Nature, 457, 1007– 1102, doi:10.1038/nature07770, 2009. 1454

Blunier, T. and Brook, E. J.: Timing of millennial-scale climate change in Antarctica and Greenland during the last glacial period, Science, 291, 109–112, 2001. 1454

- land during the last glacial period, Science, 291, 109–112, 2001. 1454
   Blunier, T., Chappellaz, J., Schwander, J., Dällenbach, A., Stauffer, B., Stocker, T. F., Raynaud, D., Jouzel, J., Clausen, H. B., Hammer, C. U., and Johnsen, S. J.: Asynchrony of Antarctic and Greenland climate change during the last glacial period, Nature, 394, 739–743, 1998. 1454, 1459
- <sup>25</sup> Blunier, T., Spahni, R., Barnola, J.-M., Chappellaz, J., Loulergue, L., and Schwander, J.: Synchronization of ice core records via atmospheric gases, Clim. Past, 3, 325–330, doi:10.5194/cp-3-325-2007, 2007. 1454, 1456, 1460, 1465
  - Capron, E., Landais, A., Chappellaz, J., Schilt, A., Buiron, D., Dahl-Jensen, D., Johnsen, S. J., Jouzel, J., Lemieux-Dudon, B., Loulergue, L., Leuenberger, M., Masson-Delmotte, V., Meyer,



H., Oerter, H., and Stenni, B.: Capron, E., Landais, A., Chappellaz, J., Schilt, A., Buiron, D., Dahl-Jensen, D., Johnsen, S. J., Jouzel, J., Lemieux-Dudon, B., Loulergue, L., Leuenberger, M., Masson-Delmotte, V., Meyer, H., Oerter, H., and Stenni, B.: Millennial and sub-millennial scale climatic variations recorded in polar ice cores over the last glacial period, Clim. Past, 6, 345–365, doi:10.5194/cp-6-345-2010, 2010. 1455

6, 345–365, doi:10.5194/cp-6-345-2010, 2010. 1455 Chappellaz, J., Blunier, T., Raynaud, D., Barnola, J. M., Schwander, J., and Stauffer, B.: Synchronous changes in atmospheric CH<sub>4</sub> and Greenland climate between 40 and 8 kyr BP, Nature, 366, 443–445, 1993. 1454

Chappellaz, J., Blunier, T., Kints, S., Dällenbach, A., Barnola, J.-M., Schwander, J., Raynaud,

 D., and Stauffer, B.: Changes in the atmospheric CH<sub>4</sub> gradient between Greenland and Antarctica during the Holocene, J. Geophys. Res., 102, 15987–15997, 1997. 1465
 EPICA-community-members: One-to-one coupling of glacial climate variability in Greenland and Antarctica, Nature, 444, 195–198, doi:10.1038/nature05301, 2006. 1455, 1459, 1466
 Gouion, C., Barnola, J.-M., and Ritz, C.: Modeling the densification of polar firn including heat

diffusion: Application to close-off characteristics and gas isotopic fractionation for Antarctica and Greenland sites, J. Geophys. Res., 108, 4792, doi:10.1029/2002JD003319, 2003. 1455, 1460

Huybrechts, P., Rybak, O., Pattyn, F., Ruth, U., and Steinhage, D.: Ice thinning, upstream advection, and non-climatic biases for the upper 89% of the EDML ice core from a nested

- <sup>20</sup> model of the Antarctic ice sheet, Clim. Past, 3, 577–589, doi:10.5194/cp-3-577-2007, 2007. 1455
  - Johnsen, S. J., Clausen, H. B., Dansgaard, W., Fuhrer, K., Gundestrup, N., Hammer, C. U., Iversen, P., Jouzel, J., Stauffer, B., and Steffensen, J. P.: Irregular glacial interstadials recorded in a new Greenland ice core, Nature, 359, 311–313, 1992. 1454
- Joos, F. and Spahni, R.: Rates of change in natural and anthropogenic radiative forcing over the past 20 000 years, P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 105, 1425–1430, doi:10.1073/pnas.0707386105, 2008. 1457, 1461, 1465, 1467
  - Köhler, P., Fischer, H., and Schmitt, J.: Atmospheric  $\delta^{13}CO_2$  and its relation to  $pCO_2$  and deep ocean  $\delta^{13}C$  during the late Pleistocene, Paleoceanography, 25, PA1213, doi:10.1029/2008PA001703, 2010a. 1457
  - Köhler, P., Knorr, G., Buiron, D., Lourantou, A., and Chappellaz, J.: Rapid changes in ice core gas records Part 2: Understanding the rapid rise in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> at the onset of the Bølling/Allerød, Clim. Past Discuss., 6, 1473–1501, doi:10.5194/cpd-6-1473-2010, 2010b.

30



1456, 1460

5

Lemieux-Dudon, B., Blayo, E., Petit, J.-R., Waelbroeck, C., Svensson, A., Ritz, C., Barnola, J.-M., Narcisi, B. M., and Parrenin, F.: Consistent dating for Antarctic and Greenland ice cores, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 29, 8–20, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2009.11.010, 2010. 1454, 1455, 1456, 1466, 1466

1455, 1456, 1459, 1460, 1466, 1468

- Loulergue, L., Parrenin, F., Blunier, T., Barnola, J.-M., Spahni, R., Schilt, A., Raisbeck, G., and Chappellaz, J.: New constraints on the gas age-ice age difference along the EPICA ice cores, 0–50 kyr, Clim. Past, 3, 527–540, doi:10.5194/cp-3-527-2007, 2007. 1455, 1456, 1459
- Lourantou, A., Lavrič, J. V., Köhler, P., Barnola, J.-M., Michel, E., Paillard, D., Raynaud, D., and Chappellaz, J.: Constraint of the CO<sub>2</sub> rise by new atmospheric carbon isotopic measurements during the last deglaciation, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 24, GB2015, doi:10.1029/2009GB003545, 2010. 1460, 1466

Monnin, E., Indermühle, A., Dällenbach, A., Flückiger, J., Stauffer, B., Stocker, T. F., Raynaud,

- <sup>15</sup> D., and Barnola, J.-M.: Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations over the last glacial termination, Science, 291, 112–114, 2001. 1460, 1466
  - NorthGRIP-members: High-resolution record of Northern Hemisphere climate extending into the last interglacial period, Nature, 431, 147–151, 2004. 1466

Parrenin, F., Barnola, J.-M., Beer, J., Blunier, T., Castellano, E., Chappellaz, J., Dreyfus, G., Fischer, H., Fujita, S., Jouzel, J., Kawamura, K., Lemieux-Dudon, B., Loulergue, L., Masson-

- Fischer, H., Fujita, S., Jouzel, J., Kawamura, K., Lemieux-Dudon, B., Loulergue, L., Masson-Delmotte, V., Narcisi, B., Petit, J.-R., Raisbeck, G., Raynaud, D., Ruth, U., Schwander, J., Severi, M., Spahni, R., Steffensen, J. P., Svensson, A., Udisti, R., Waelbroeck, C., and Wolff, E.: The EDC3 chronology for the EPICA Dome C ice core, Clim. Past, 3, 485–497, doi:10.5194/cp-3-485-2007, 2007. 1455
- Ruth, U., Barnola, J.-M., Beer, J., Bigler, M., Blunier, T., Castellano, E., Fischer, H., Fundel, F., Huybrechts, P., Kaufmann, P., Kipfstuhl, S., Lambrecht, A., Morganti, A., Oerter, H., Parrenin, F., Rybak, O., Severi, M., Udisti, R., Wilhelms, F., and Wolff, E.: "EDML1": a chronology for the EPICA deep ice core from Dronning Maud Land, Antarctica, over the last 150 000 years, Clim. Past, 3, 475–484, doi:10.5194/cp-3-475-2007, 2007. 1455
- Schwander, J., Barnola, J.-M., Andrié, C., Leuenberger, M., Ludin, A., Raynaud, D., and Stauffer, B.: The age of the air in the firn and the ice at Summit, Greenland, J. Geophys. Res., 98, 2831–2838, 1993. 1455

Spahni, R., Schwander, J., Flückiger, J., Stauffer, B., Chappellaz, J., and Raynaud, D.: The



attenuation of fast atmospheric  $CH_4$  variations recorded in polar ice cores, Geopys. Res. Lett., 30, 1571, doi:10.1029/2003GL017093, 2003. 1456, 1457, 1465

- Spahni, R., Chappellaz, J., Stocker, T. F., Loulergue, L., Hausammann, G., Kawamura, K., Flückiger, J., Schwander, J., Raynaud, D., Masson-Delmotte, V., and Jouzel, J.: Atmospheric
- <sup>5</sup> methane and nitrous oxide of the late Pleistocene from Antarctic ice cores, Science, 310, 1317–1321, doi: 10.1126/science.1120132, 2005. 1466
  - Stenni, B., Masson-Delmotte, V., Johnsen, S., Jouzel, J., Longinelli, A., Monnin, E., Röthlisberger, R., and Selmo, E.: An oceanic cold reversal during the last deglaciation, Science, 293, 2074–2077, 2001. 1466
- Stocker, T. F. and Johnsen, S. J.: A minimum thermodynamic model for the bipolar seesaw, Paleoceanography, 18, 1087, doi:10.1029/2003PA000920, 2003. 1454, 1455
   Svensson, A., Andersen, K. K., Bigler, M., Clausen, H. B., Dahl-Jensen, D., Davies, S. M., Johnsen, S. J., Muscheler, R., Parrenin, F., Rasmussen, S. O., Röthlisberger, R., Seierstad, I., Steffensen, J. P., and Vinther, B. M.: A 60 000 year Greenland stratigraphic ice core
- <sup>15</sup> chronology, Clim. Past, 4, 47–57, doi:10.5194/cp-4-47-2008, 2008. 1455



**Table 1.** Examples of pre-industrial accumulation rates  $a_{PRE}$  and estimated typical width *E* of the age distribution PDF for selected ice cores for pre-industrial (PRE) and LGM climate conditions. Bold numbers in *E* are taken from firn densification models, italic numbers are estimated as described below. The width *E* is anti-correlated to accumulation rate, thus for ice cores without published values of *E*, it is estimated out of  $E \times a \approx$  constant for a given climate state, e.g. the constant differs for PRE and LGM.

Ice core	recent accumulation rate a <sub>PRE</sub>	E <sub>PRE</sub>	E <sub>LGM</sub>
	mm (water eq.) yr <sup>-1</sup>	yr	yr
EPICA Dome C (EDC)	25 <sup>a</sup>	<b>200</b> <sup>b</sup>	<b>600</b> <sup>b</sup>
EPICA Dome DML (EDML)	65 <sup>a</sup>	<i>80</i> <sup>c</sup>	240 <sup>c</sup>
NGRIP	174 <sup>d</sup>	<i>30</i> <sup>c</sup>	90 <sup>c</sup>
GRIP	211 <sup>e</sup>	<b>25</b> <sup>f</sup>	75 <sup>c</sup>
Byrd	110 <sup>e</sup>	45 <sup>c</sup>	136 <sup>c</sup>

References:

<sup>a</sup>: Blunier et al. (2007)

<sup>b</sup>: Joos and Spahni (2008)

<sup>c</sup>: *E* estimated based on  $E \times a \approx$  constant for either present or LGM climates.

<sup>d</sup>: Andersen et al. (2006)

<sup>e</sup>: Chappellaz et al. (1997)

<sup>f</sup>: Spahni et al. (2003)

















**Fig. 3.** Conceptual sketch of ice core synchronisation of NGRIP and EDC via CH<sub>4</sub> for 14.6 kyr BP, the onset of the Bølling/Allerød warm period. (**A**): Following the dating of Lemieux-Dudon et al. (2010). (**B**): Proposed revised dating, if not CH<sub>4</sub> measured in situ in ice cores, but potentially atmospheric CH<sub>4</sub> are taken for synchronisation. From top to bottom: NGRIP  $\delta^{18}$ O, NGRIP CH<sub>4</sub>, EDC CH<sub>4</sub>, EDC CO<sub>2</sub>, EDC  $\delta$ D. Black lines are in situ ice core measurements, red lines are potentially underlying atmospheric records. Red numbers indicate the dating offset at mid-transition points between ice core and atmospheric gas records.







**Fig. 4.** Effect of the gas age distribution on a synthetic  $CH_4$  peak of 400 ppbv. **(A)** Peak attenuation for three different mean gas ages *E*, which represent LGM conditions of the NGRIP, EDML and EDC ice cores without age correction. **(B)** Same as in (A), but potential ice cores records are now aged corrected (shifted by *E* to younger ages). Circles mark the mid-transition points defined as a  $CH_4$  concentration of 600 ppbv. **(C)** Same as in (B) for pre-industrial climate conditions. **(D)** Potential synchronisation error during Termination I for the transition into the Bølling/Allerød, here the width *E* of the age distribution PDF lie in-between those of LGM and PRE. Mid-transition points are synchronised and bold lines show what the atmospheric signal would look like depending on the potential ice core  $CH_4$  from which it is deconvolved. Atmospheric  $CH_4$  rises and declines in 50 years in A, B, C and in 200 years in D.





**Fig. 5.** Difference of the mid-transition points of rapid changes in atmospheric  $CH_4$  and potential in situ measurements of  $CH_4$  in ice cores depending on the width *E* of the age distribution PDF in the ice core and the rate of change in atmospheric  $CH_4$  (here rapid changes in atmospheric  $CH_4$  occurred in either 50 or 200 years). The example of the mid-transition points offset of the  $CH_4$  rise at the Bølling/Allerød (B/A) recorded potentially in NGRIP and EDC is illustrated in detail.

